

Alan Jones <AlanJones@stny.rr.com> hide details Jun 11 (4 days ago) to ●
Zhonghao Shou <earthquake.prediction@gmail.com>,
Susan Hough <hough@gps.caltech.edu> cc
"Dr.Saumitra Mukherjee" <dr.saumitramukherjee@usa.net>,
Dong Choi <editor@ncgt.org>,
"Dr. Orhan Cerit" <cerit@cumhuriyet.edu.tr>,
Ken Middaugh <Ken_Middaugh@sbcglobal.net>,
Darrell Harrington <darrell.harrington@gmail.com>,
Ara <arabram@yahoo.com>,
Roger Hunter <rogerh@lpbroadband.net> date Jun 11, 2007 9:50 AM subject Re: Your
predictions mailed-by stny.rr.com Zhonghao,

I consider my review past history. I believe I gave your paper a fair review and I stand by it. You will recall that when I took my first look at your work, I decided you had a significant result. But then when I went through each prediction, this did not hold up.

You say you want your work to be recognized. To do that you must present your predictions ahead of time for others to evaluate. I doubt your work will be accepted as long as you make the predictions and you evaluate the predictions. This is an obvious conflict of interest.

I am willing to evaluate your future predictions if you send them to me before the time window begins. I can only evaluate them if they have clearly defined windows. That is a magnitude window (max and min or just a min), a time window (which should be expressed in UTC), and a space window. The space window should either be a clearly defined rectangular window or a circle with a clearly defined center and radius. The radius should be specified in km or degrees of arc.

And, as I did in my review of your paper, the limits of the windows are to be followed EXACTLY. If you want to allow an event to be counted as a hit which is, say, 0.5 degrees of arc outside of your space windows, they you must make your window wider by this much. In this way there is no interpretation. A given event is either a hit or it is not a hit. Of course, as you make the window larger, the probability of a hit by chance increases lessening the significance of your results.

Two other rules:

- Once a prediction is made, it cannot be changed.
- The predictions must be independent. That is, they cannot overlap in space. If two predictions are made which overlap in time but are not close in distance, that would be okay.

You should send these predictions to me and to Roger Hunter and any others who are interested. It would be very interesting to have several people evaluating the predictions.

Are you interested in doing this?

Regards,

Alan Jones

Alan Jones

AlanJones@stny.rr.com
<http://home.stny.rr.com/alanjones>
607-786-5866
3717 Wildwood Drive
Endwell, NY 13760
#####